Item 10

Supplementary Answers to Previous Questions

Supplementary Answers to Questions on Notice are as follows:

Question on Notice – Council 20 February 2023

5. City of Sydney Waste Disposal

By Councillor Scott

Question

1. In the last five years, has the City withheld payment for waste services at any time from any external providers? If so, when, how much and what for?

No. Payments are adjusted to reflect work undertaken by contracted service providers.

2. If not, will the City consider this option in future? If not, why not?

The City always reviews invoices to ensure that payments are correct.

- Has the City sought any contract amendments from Cleanaway since 2019?
 No.
- 4. Have Cleanaway sought any contract amendments from the City since 2019?

 No.
- 5. What are the additional costs that the City has incurred as a result of increased waste complaints?

Nil additional costs associated with the management of the waste complaints.

6. Please detail, broken down by month since 2018, how many complaints of missed collection the City has received?

Below reflects the number of bins due for lift that the city collects every year.

| Stream | Number of bins due for lift per week | Number of bins due for lift per year |
|--------|--------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| Red | 55,835 | 2,903,420 |
| Yellow | 39,828 | 2,071,056 |
| Green* | 4,461 | 231,972 |
| | 100,124 | 5,206,448 |

^{*}Green bins are collected fortnightly, above is average per week

The below table reflects the total number of reported missed services for all waste streams including all bin types, mattresses and bulky waste bookings.

| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sept | Oct | Nov | Dec |
|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|
| 2018 | 1548 | 1799 | 1642 | 996 | 1338 | 835 | 871 | 1274 | 1037 | 1260 | 1549 | 1470 |
| 2019 | 2084 | 1426 | 1221 | 1241 | 1161 | 1083 | 5799 | 1969 | 1324 | 1256 | 1904 | 1374 |
| 2020 | 1445 | 1458 | 1825 | 2629 | 1295 | 1125 | 1259 | 1082 | 1205 | 1282 | 1086 | 1486 |
| 2021 | 1332 | 1590 | 1382 | 1299 | 1071 | 1221 | 1195 | 1427 | 2979 | 2858 | 1330 | 1517 |
| 2022 | 3922 | 1727 | 2022 | 2011 | 2202 | 1978 | 1759 | 1280 | 1349 | 2010 | 2785 | 2209 |
| 2023 | 3713 | 4624 | | | | | | | | | | |

7. Please detail, broken down by month since 2018, how many requests for bulk collection the City has received? Of these, how many have been collected on the day booked? How many have been missed? How many have been delayed?

The below table details total number of bookings received, per year and month versus service provider.

| Year/Month | City - Garbage Services | Cleanaway | URM | Waste - Soft Landing | Grand Total |
|-------------------|-------------------------|-----------|-------|----------------------|--------------------|
| 2018 | | | | | |
| Jan | 1656 | N/A | 3256 | 894 | 5806 |
| Feb | 1139 | N/A | 2435 | 782 | 4356 |
| Mar | 1132 | N/A | 2480 | 802 | 4414 |
| Apr | 1185 | N/A | 2413 | 791 | 4389 |
| May | 1131 | N/A | 2396 | 837 | 4364 |
| Jun | 936 | N/A | 2118 | 761 | 3815 |
| Jul | 1182 | N/A | 2620 | 866 | 4668 |
| Aug | 1049 | N/A | 2470 | 830 | 4349 |
| Sep | 1102 | N/A | 2371 | 754 | 4227 |
| Oct | 1212 | N/A | 2612 | 886 | 4710 |
| Nov | 1251 | N/A | 2822 | 902 | 4975 |
| Dec | 1421 | N/A | 2794 | 830 | 5045 |
| Total 2018 | 14396 | 0 | 30787 | 9935 | 55118 |

| 2019 | City - Garbage Services | Cleanaway | URM | Waste - Soft Landing | Grand Total |
|------|-------------------------|-----------|------|----------------------|--------------------|
| Jan | 1878 | N/A | 3512 | 1042 | 6432 |
| Feb | 1577 | N/A | 3050 | 988 | 5615 |
| Mar | 1395 | N/A | 2919 | 1016 | 5330 |
| Apr | 1448 | N/A | 2846 | 996 | 5290 |
| May | 1218 | N/A | 2730 | 884 | 4832 |
| Jun | 1109 | N/A | 2413 | 773 | 4295 |
| Jul | 1020 | 3413 | 14 | 1004 | 5451 |
| Aug | 856 | 3113 | N/A | 824 | 4793 |

| City - Garbage Services | Cleanaway | URM | Waste - Soft Landing | Grand Total |
|-------------------------|----------------------------|---|--|---|
| 949 | 3336 | N/A | 890 | 5175 |
| 955 | 3453 | N/A | 813 | 5221 |
| 1012 | 3460 | N/A | 866 | 5338 |
| 1157 | 3793 | N/A | 929 | 5879 |
| 14574 | 20568 | 17484 | 11025 | 63651 |
| | 949 955 1012 1157 | 949 3336 955 3453 1012 3460 1157 3793 | 949 3336 N/A 955 3453 N/A 1012 3460 N/A 1157 3793 N/A | 949 3336 N/A 890 955 3453 N/A 813 1012 3460 N/A 866 1157 3793 N/A 929 |

| 2020 | City - Garbage Services | Cleanaway | URM | Waste - Soft Landing | Grand Total |
|------------|-------------------------|-----------|-----|----------------------|--------------------|
| Jan | 1361 | 4313 | N/A | 1072 | 6746 |
| Feb | 1128 | 3980 | N/A | 1074 | 6182 |
| Mar | 820 | 4677 | N/A | 1222 | 6719 |
| Apr | N/A | 6421 | N/A | 1480 | 7901 |
| May | N/A | 5530 | N/A | 1240 | 6770 |
| Jun | N/A | 5579 | N/A | 1288 | 6867 |
| Jul | N/A | 5918 | N/A | 1388 | 7306 |
| Aug | N/A | 5842 | N/A | 1321 | 7163 |
| Sep | N/A | 6017 | N/A | 1318 | 7335 |
| Oct | N/A | 5577 | N/A | 1210 | 6787 |
| Nov | N/A | 5967 | N/A | 1316 | 7283 |
| Dec | N/A | 6662 | N/A | 1314 | 7976 |
| Total 2020 | 3309 | 66483 | 0 | 15243 | 85035 |

| 2021 | City - Garbage Services | Cleanaway | URM | Waste - Soft Landing | Grand Total |
|------|-------------------------|-----------|-----|----------------------|--------------------|
| Jan | N/A | 7180 | N/A | 1408 | 8588 |
| Feb | N/A | 6041 | N/A | 1395 | 7436 |
| Mar | N/A | 6056 | N/A | 1371 | 7427 |
| Apr | N/A | 5554 | N/A | 1235 | 6789 |
| May | N/A | 5574 | N/A | 1187 | 6761 |
| Jun | N/A | 5119 | N/A | 1108 | 6227 |

| Year/Month | City - Garbage Services | Cleanaway | URM | Waste - Soft Landing | Grand Total |
|-------------------|-------------------------|-----------|-----|----------------------|--------------------|
| Jul | N/A | 5881 | N/A | 1274 | 7155 |
| Aug | N/A | 6162 | N/A | 1342 | 7504 |
| Sep | N/A | 5596 | N/A | 1245 | 6841 |
| Oct | N/A | 5383 | N/A | 1166 | 6549 |
| Nov | N/A | 5557 | N/A | 1243 | 6800 |
| Dec | N/A | 5782 | N/A | 1224 | 7006 |
| Total 2021 | 0 | 69885 | 0 | 15198 | 85083 |

| 2022 | City - Garbage Services | Cleanaway | URM | Waste - Soft Landing | Grand Total |
|------------|-------------------------|-----------|-----|----------------------|--------------------|
| Jan | N/A | 6446 | N/A | 1221 | 7667 |
| Feb | N/A | 5134 | N/A | 1180 | 6314 |
| Mar | N/A | 6051 | N/A | 1259 | 7310 |
| Apr | N/A | 5499 | N/A | 1140 | 6639 |
| May | N/A | 5862 | N/A | 1258 | 7120 |
| Jun | N/A | 5208 | N/A | 1085 | 6293 |
| Jul | N/A | 2373 | N/A | 511 | 2884 |
| Aug | N/A | 5475 | N/A | 1204 | 6679 |
| Sep | N/A | 4702 | N/A | 1055 | 5757 |
| Oct | N/A | 3359 | N/A | 787 | 4146 |
| Nov | N/A | 4100 | N/A | 855 | 4955 |
| Dec | N/A | 2543 | N/A | 650 | 3193 |
| Total 2022 | 0 | 56752 | 0 | 12205 | 68957 |

| 2023 | City - Garbage Services | Cleanaway | URM | Waste - Soft Landing | Grand Total |
|--------------------|-------------------------|-----------|-------|----------------------|--------------------|
| Jan | N/A | 1893 | | 660 | 2553 |
| Feb | N/A | 591 | | 303 | 894 |
| YTD 2023 | | 2484 | 0 | 963 | 3447 |
| | | | | | |
| Grand Total | 32279 | 216172 | 48271 | 64569 | 361291 |

The below table details total requests received over the same period (as at 28 February 2023), including detail about days to complete request versus scheduled date:

| Early | 3148 |
|----------------------|--------|
| On time - on day due | 138153 |
| Past due | 219900 |
| Not yet completed | 90 |
| | 361291 |

No bulky waste is ever missed, all bulky waste is eventually collected. Waste is sometimes reported as not presented, generally because it has been recycled or repurposed by others.

8. What other metrics does the City collect on waste and recycling collection services? How are these monitored?

| Service Level Measurement | Frequency |
|---|------------------|
| 1- Sustainable Safe Service | |
| Management of Personnel | |
| % of safety inspections conducted (safety interactions) of its employees or subcontractors in accordance with the Contractors inspection program. | Monthly |
| Attend meetings with City WHS representatives as required | As Requested |
| Provision of adequate WHS supervision of personnel | As Requested |
| Tool Box or Start Up meetings have safety contact | As Requested |
| Contract specific risk register is developed and updated and available on an ongoing basis within 3 months of Contract and available to the City | As Requested |
| Contract specific WHS Incident register is developed and updated and available on an ongoing basis within 3 months of Contract and available to the City | As Requested |
| Escalation process for managing WHS incidents and risk is developed and updated as required | As Requested |
| Risk, Safety and Incident Management | |
| % of incidences and near misses recorded immediately, including mitigation strategies, investigations closed out within 10 business days with root cause analysis, incident to be mitigated immediately with plan to close out within 2 weeks | Monthly |
| Evidence of inspections and audits recorded. Monthly reporting of safety performance indicators | Monthly |
| Comply with all statutory reporting and report as part of the Contractors monthly report. | Monthly |
| Contractor audits compliance with all WHS requirements and undertaken in accordance with Contractor audit program. | Monthly |
| Management of Personnel and Training | |
| % of environmental inspections conducted of its employees, subcontractors, equipment in accordance with the Contractors inspection program. | Monthly |
| Attend meetings with City Environmental representatives as required | As Requested |
| Provision of adequate Environmental supervision of personnel | As Requested |
| Tool Box or Start Up meetings have environmental contact | As Requested |
| Environmental, Risk Incident Management | |
| Contract specific environmental risk register is always developed and updated and available on an ongoing basis within 3 months of Contract and available to the City | As Requested |
| Contract specific environmental Incident register is always developed and updated and available on an ongoing basis within 3 months of Contract and available to the City | As Requested |
| Escalation process for managing environmental incidents and risk is developed and updated as required | As Requested |
| No materials, oils, liquids are spilt during collection | Monthly |
| Any materials, oils, liquids are spilt during collection is cleared within 2hrs or as required by WHS or Environmental rules, policy or legislation (whichever is quicker) | Monthly |
| Compliance with all legislation and Environmental requirements | By Quality Audit |

| Process and Systems in Place | | |
|---|---------|--|
| % of incidences and near misses recorded immediately, including mitigation strategies, investigations closed out within 10 business days with root cause analysis, incident to be mitigated immediately with plan to close out within 2 weeks | Monthly | |
| Evidence of inspections and audits recorded. Monthly reporting of environmental performance indicators | Monthly | |
| Comply with all statutory reporting and report as part of the Contractors monthly report. | Monthly | |
| Contractor audits compliance with all Environmental requirements and undertaken in accordance with Contractor audit program. | Monthly | |
| Traffic infringements are recorded immediately, investigated including mitigation strategies, investigations closed out within 10 business days with root cause analysis | Monthly | |
| Third Party vehicle damage is recorded immediately, investigated closed out within 10 business days with root cause analysis | Monthly | |
| Third Party property damage is recorded immediately, investigated closed out within 10 business days with root cause analysis | Monthly | |
| Contractor undertakes scheduled maintenance procedures in accordance with all OEM and Clean Fleet minimum requirements | Monthly | |
| 2 - Quality Waste Collection Service | | |
| Service Delivery Compliance against Standards | | |
| Missed Garbage collection ≤ 1 per 1,000 services | Monthly | |
| Missed Recyclables collection ≤ 1 per 1,000 services | Monthly | |
| Missed Garden Organics Collection ≤ 1 per 1,000 services | Monthly | |
| Missed Clean Up Collection ≤ 1 per 150 services | Monthly | |
| 100% of unsuccessful Mobile Bins collections are collected within 24hrs of nominated Collection Day and time period | Monthly | |
| Nil early starts for any Collection Service | Monthly | |
| Specific recovered material streams are delivered to the processing facility in the intended condition. Recyclables and Organic streams are not rejected at the material recovery facility due to Contamination or compaction. | Monthly | |
| Reduction of Customer Complaints | | |
| ≤ 40 complaints on Garbage collection services | Monthly | |
| ≤ 40 complaints for Recyclables collection | Monthly | |
| ≤ 10 complaints on Garden Organics collection Services | | |
| ≤ 10 complaints on Clean Up collection Services | | |
| Mobile Bin repair request are serviced within 2 days | Monthly | |
| New Bin Service requests are fulfilled within 2 days | Monthly | |
| New Mobile Bin replaced on day of service when Mobile Bins are beyond economical repair. | Monthly | |
| All complaints resolved or escalated and documented in a complaint register as part of the monthly report | Monthly | |
| Customer Responsiveness | | |
| All responses to customer complaints resolved within the specified timeframes. Complaints resolution within 24hrs or as otherwise agreed with the City. | Monthly | |
| % of attendance at all scheduled & ad-hoc meetings | Monthly | |
| All information as requested by the City for use in relation to stakeholder management is delivered within agreed timelines | Monthly | |
| Provision of accurate, up to date and completed reports by the due date | Monthly | |

| 3 - Effective Contract & Commercial Management | |
|--|-----------------|
| Meeting and Reporting | |
| Develop, implement and maintain a Business Continuity plan | As Requested |
| All required data and documents, missed services footage etc are accessible to City via a web portal | Monthly |
| 100% accurate monthly invoices | Monthly |

7. Waste Management in the City of Sydney

By Councillor Weldon

Question

1. How many missed waste and recycling collections were reported to the City of Sydney in each of the preceding 12 months (January 2022 to January 2023)?

The below table details missed waste and recycling bin reports received by month from January 2022 to 22 January 2023.

| | Missed Garbage Bin | Missed Recycling |
|-------|-----------------------|---------------------|
| 2022 | | |
| Jan | 1019 | 847 |
| Feb | 456 | 235 |
| Mar | 459 | 348 |
| April | 609 | 268 |
| May | 511 | 373 |
| June | 449 | 370 |
| July | 476 | 376 |
| Aug | 406 | 256 |
| Sept | 458 | 314 |
| Oct | 588 | 505 |
| Nov | 613 | 914 |
| Dec | 711 | 696 |
| 2023 | | |
| Jan | 1326 | 965 |

2. How much did the City of Sydney expend on waste management services (combined in-house and contracted services) in each of the last five years (FY2017/18, FY2018/19, FY2019/20 and FY2020/21 and FY2021/22)?

| Unit 2020 Cleansing and Waste Operating Expenditure | 2021-22 | 2020-21 | 2019-20 | 2018-19 | 2017-18 |
|---|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| Salaries and Wages Expenditure | \$24.7M | \$24.5M | \$29.6M | \$28.5M | \$26.8M |
| Non Salaries and Wages Related Expenditure- including all contracts | \$40.6M | \$39.8M | \$37.3M | \$34.5M | \$32.0M |
| Total Expenditure | \$65.3M | \$64.3M | \$66.9M | \$63.0M | \$58.8M |

This table represents operating costs only and does not include capital purchases or corporate overheads.

3. What was the number of full time/part time staff employed by the City of Sydney engaged in collecting waste in each of the last five years (FY2017/18, FY2018/19, FY2019/20 and FY2020/21 and FY2021/22)?

| | FTE Cleansing and Waste Operations |
|------|------------------------------------|
| 2018 | 181 |
| 2019 | 188 |
| 2020 | 181 |
| 2021 | 193 |
| 2022 | 183 |
| 2023 | 189 |

Cleansing and Waste Operations includes street cleaning and sweeping, street litter bin collection, and food scraps collection.

- 6. If the answer to 5. is yes:
 - (a) On how many occasions and on what dates have City of Sydney employees collected waste that is part of the contract obligations of Cleanaway?

The City responds to urgent complaints and health and safety issues, as required. Payments are adjusted to reflect work not completed by contracted service providers.

As a result of the protected industrial action the City has collected 2293 illegal dumps and booked clean ups since 30 January 2023.

(b) What are the terms under which City of Sydney employees are doing work that is part of the contract obligations of Cleanaway?

The City maintains responsibility for the management of waste, Cleanaway is only paid for waste they have collected, in accordance with the Schedule of Rates as per the contract. Monthly invoices are reconciled and paid on services delivered.

7. Were any privately operated waste collection companies engaged by City of Sydney prior to the execution of the contract with Cleanaway?

Refer to 20 February 2023 report to Council – City of Sydney Waste Management and Operating Environment.

- 8. If the answer to 7. is yes:
 - **(c)** What was the value of the contracts with City of Sydney with each of the companies?

| Provider | Amount Spent | Contract Term | Commenced |
|--------------|--------------|--|------------|
| URM | \$72.6M | 5+2 Years plus variation to 30 June 2019 | 10/03/2010 |
| Soft Landing | \$4.6M | 3+1+1 Years | 01/08/2018 |